

DEUIFD XLIX/ 2019, ss. 7-47.

**THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE SUNNAH AND THE
WAHY AND ITS EFFECTS ON THE AUTHORITY OF
SUNNAH ACCORDING TO SOME CONTEMPORARY
SCHOLARS**

İbrahim KUTLUAY*

ABSTRACT

There is no doubt that the Qur'an and the Sunnah are the two main sources of Islām. It is also axiomatic that throughout Islāmīc history, only a few marginal groups such as *Zanādiqa* (heretics), some extremists named Rāfiḍīs and *Ahl al-Qur'an*, influenced by some orientalists, and emerged in the Indian sub-continent and Egypt in modern times, disregarded the Sunnah of the Prophet as an essential source of Islām by casting some doubts. But the problem of the authority of the Sunnah, in other words, whether the Sunnah is completely binding, and if it is, to what extent it is and which sorts of the Sunnah are binding is a controversial issue among Muslim scholars. Shortly, the source of this problem is related to the relationship of the Sunnah with the divine revelation (*wahy*). The correct understanding of the Sunnah and the determination of its authority, therefore, depend on the determination of its relationship with *wahy*. The solution of this problem is also based on whether the Prophet received any *wahy* apart from the Holy Qur'an. Accordingly, Muslim scholars have adopted different views on this matter. Most of them classified *wahy* into two parts as *al-wahy al-matlum* and *al-wahy al-ghayr al-matlum*. Thus, this study is an attempt to determine and organize different opinions of contemporary Muslim scholars on this issue and assess them through classification in the first instance. Secondly, it will evaluate the validity of these

* Prof. Dr., İzmir Katip Çelebi University, Faculty of Islāmīc Sciences, Ḥadīth Department İzmir, Turkey, e-mail: i_kutluay@yahoo.com, ORCID ID: orcid.org/0000-0003-31499556

In the transcription of Arabic letters, we have used for a ا, b ب, t ت, th ث, j ج, h ح, kh خ, d د, dh ذ, r ر, z ز, s س, sh ش, ṣ ص, ḍ ض, ṭ ط, ṣ ظ, (ayn) ع, gh غ, f ف, q ق, k ك, l ل, m م, n ن, h ه, w و, y ي; for long vowels ā, ī, ū.

Makalenin Hakemlere Gönderiliş Tarihi : 22/04/2019

Makalenin Hakemlerden Geliş Tarihi : 29/05/2019

arguments and discuss these varying approaches and the kind of results that they have caused.

Keywords: The Sunnah, Wahy, Hadith, The Prophet, Authority

SÜNNET - VAHİY İLİŞKİSİ VE BAZI ÇAĞDAŞ ÂLİMLERE GÖRE BUNUN SÜNNET'İN OTORİTESİNE ETKİSİ

ÖZ

Kur'an'ın ve Sünnet'in İslâm'ın iki temel kaynağı olduğunda şüphe bulunmamaktadır. Müsellem bir gerçektir ki Zenâdika, bazı aşırı Râfiziler ve modern dönemde oryantalistlerden etkilenen Hint alt kıtasında ve Mısır'da ortaya çıkan Ehl-i Kur'an, İslâm tarihinde Sünnet'e dair bazı şüpheler izhar ederek Hz. Peygamber'in sünnetinin İslâm'ın zorunlu bir kaynağı olduğunu reddetmişlerdir. Ancak Sünnet'in otoritesi problemi, başka bir ifade ile Sünnet'in tamamının bağlayıcı olup olmadığı, bağlayıcı ise hangi ölçüde ve ne tür Sünnet'in bağlayıcı olduğu meselesi Müslüman âlimler arasında tartışmalıdır. Kısaca bu problemin kaynağı, Sünnet'in ilahî vahiyle münasebetine bağlıdır. Bu sebeple Sünnet'in doğru anlaşılması ve otoritesinin tespit edilmesi, onun vahiyle münasebetinin isabetli bir şekilde tespit edilmesine bağlıdır. Ayrıca bu problemin çözümü, Hz. Peygamber'in Kur'an'dan başka vahiy alıp almadığına dayanmaktadır. Bundan dolayı İslâm âlimleri bu hususta iki farklı görüşü benimsemişlerdir. Onların çoğu, vahyi, *vahy-i metlûv* ve *vahyi gayr-i metlûv* şeklinde iki kısma ayırmışlardır. İşte bu çalışma, konu ile ilgili çağdaş Müslüman âlimlerin farklı görüşlerini belirlemeye ve bu görüşleri gruplandırarak haklarında hüküm vermeye gayret etmektedir. İkinci olarak çalışmamız, onların kullandıkları delillerin muteber olup olmadığını, bu husustaki çeşitli yaklaşımları ve ne tür sonuçları olduğunu değerlendirmeyi amaçlamaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Sünnet, Vahiy, Hadis, Hz. Peygamber, Otorite

Introduction

It is obvious that the Prophet (pbuh) is the person who can understand and know best what Allah Almighty aims by and means in the verses of Qur'an as the one the Qur'an was sent down upon,¹ simply because Allah assigned him the duty of the explanation of the Qur'an for his Ummah and showing of its practice.² For this purpose, Allah

¹ Abū Ishāk İbrahim b. Mūsā b. Muḥammad el-Gırnaṭī Shaṭībī, *al-Muwāfaqāt* (Cairo: Maṭbaa Muṣṭafa Muḥammad, no date), 4: 26.

² al-Naḥl 16: 44.

appointed His messenger as a judge in all disputes among Muslims. So, it is mandatory that whole believers have to accept his decisions with full submission.³

The Qur'ān reveals that obedience to Allah (the Qur'ān) and His Messenger (the Sunnah) is compulsory⁴ and disobedience to the Prophet and acting to oppose him is a *kufr* (disbelieving).⁵ Refusing his judgments and turning away are the signs of hypocrisy (*nifāq*).⁶ According to the Qur'ān, even not going away until we get the Prophet's permission in his presence, is an essential characteristics of being a believer. Thus, Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya (d. 751/1350) says: al-Nūr 24: 62 indicates that we should take permission from the Prophet in the scientific issues as well.⁷

We absolutely need the Prophet to learn what Allah sent down to the people. In other words, without the Messenger, it is not possible to know the practice and contents of the Qur'ān. Therefore, The Qur'ān and the Sunnah constitute the fundamental sources of Islām. The Prophet explains The Qur'ān and adds some rulings to it. In other words, as a rule, the Qur'ān establishes the fundamentals of the Religion, determines its main principles, and the Sunnah explains them, depicts their practical form, and adds some principles.

However, at this point, there are two main problems: What is the source of the Sunnah and to what extent does the Sunnah depend on *wahy*? Second, what are the components of the Sunnah and which parts of the Sunnah are the individual judgments and opinions of the Prophet? In order to give satisfactory answers to these questions, first of all, we have to determine the relationship between the Sunnah and *wahy* (divine revelation) and the sources of the Sunnah.

As will be seen, except a small group of extremists, main stream of the Muslim scholars argues that the Sunnah is neither the only result

³ al-Nisā 4: 65.

⁴ Āl-i 'Imrān 3: 122; al-Anfāl 8: 24; al-Nūr 24: 63.

⁵ Āl-i 'Imrān 3: 31; al-Nūr 24: 60; al-Aḥzāb 33: 36.

⁶ al-Nūr 24: 47, 48, 51.

⁷ Muṣṭafā Sibā'ī, *al-Sunnah wa makānatuhā fi al-tashrīḥ al-Islāmī* (Damascus: el-Maktaba al-Islāmiyya no date), 50.

of individual opinions and the judgments of the Prophet nor it is a kind of *wahy* absolutely resembling the Qur'ān; because ḥadīths are the expressions of the Prophet, thus they cannot be recited in the prayers (salāt) like the Qur'ān. The majority of Muslim scholars take place between these two extreme opinions (either all of the Sunnah is *wahy* or whole of it is solely personal opinions of the prophet), however the discussions and disputes of the main stream of the Muslim scholars depend on which kind of the Sunnah is binding and which one is a result of *wahy*.

In following pages, related to this issue, we will examine just three verses which are employed by Muslim scholars to explain the source of the Sunnah: al-Najm 53: 3-4 and al-Ḥashr 59:6, and a group of other verses dealing with *ḥikma* given to the Prophet.⁸ Apart from these, we will also study some ḥadīths that indicate the source of the Sunnah and are mostly used by the defenders of the Sunnah to point out to the relation between the Sunnah and *wahy*.

1. Did The Prophet Receive Any Revelation Other Than The Qur'ān?

As mentioned above, the source of the Sunnah and whether the Prophet received any revelation apart from the Qur'ān are controversial among Muslim scholars and three different opinions have emerged on this matter:

i. The Sunnah completely depends on a kind of *wahy*⁹ like the Qur'ān.

⁸ al-Baqara, 2: 151, 231; Āl-i 'Imrān 3: 164; al-Nisā 4:113; al-Jumua' 62: 2; al-Aḥzāb 33: 34.

⁹ This sort of *wahy* is just its meaning from Allah Subhānahū wa Taālā and it differs from Qur'ānic revelation/*wahy* which is read in the Salāt, and it's words and meaning is from Allah. As Robson indicates that revelation could come to the Prophet in different ways, and that what came to him, while all of divine origin, was treated on different levels. The Qur'ān was the highest level, but it would seem that Muḥammad could receive a types of inspiration not so high. William A. Graham, *Divine Word and Prophetic Word in the Early Islam* (Paris: Mouton 1977), 33 (from Robson, *Material*, 178. *MW*, 41 (1951), 166-180, 257-270.

ii. The Sunnah depends on the *ijtihāds* (the individual opinions) of the Prophet as well as *wahy*.

iii. The Sunnah does not include any *wahy*. It consists of the Prophet's own comments and interpretations on the Qur'ān by using his intellect and his experience which he had gathered from his surroundings and the culture of the society he lived in.

In the following pages, we will discuss these three opinions and their consequences in detail.

1.1. The Scholars Who Defend the Sunnah Depends on the Revelation/*Wahy* and Their Evidence

The fact that those defend the view that the Messenger of Allah is under the supervision of *wahy* and his all words are related to a kind of *wahy* depends on some verses such as al-Najm 53: 3-4, al-Baqara 3: 142-144, al-Anfāl 8: 7, Yūnus 10: 15, al-Aḥzāb 33: 37, al-Aḥqāf 46:9, al-Faṭḥ 48: 27, al-Taḥrīm 66: 3 etc. although according to most scholars, these verses refer to the *wahy* of the Qur'ān.

The most frequently referenced verse (āyat) takes place in Chapter Najm: “*Your companion (Muḥammad) has neither gone astray nor has erred. Nor does he speak of (his own) desire. It is only a Revelation revealed.*”¹⁰ This verse indicates that the Prophet does not speak from his self (*hawā*). Shortly, this group of scholars argue that the Qur'ān is revealed verbatim to the Prophet, that is both its meaning and wording from Allah; besides, they use some other verses and ḥadīths as well, as evidence to prove their opinions. For example, the verses which order to believe in the Prophet,¹¹ and the verses declaring that the Prophet is given the book and *hikma* by Allah,¹² and other verses commanding that ‘whatever the Prophet gives them, it should be taken and whatever he forbids, it should be avoided’,¹³ and also other verses.¹⁴ Their final argument is that

¹⁰ al-Najm 53: 3-4.

¹¹ al-Nisā 4: 61, 136; al-Faṭḥ 48: 8, 9, 58; al-Taghābūn 64: 8; al-Ḥujurāt 48: 15; al-Nūr 24: 62.

¹² al-Baqara, 2: 151, 231; Āl-i ‘Imrān 3: 164; al-Nisā 4: 113; al-Jumua’ 62: 2; al-Aḥzāb 33: 34.

¹³ al-Ḥashr 59: 7.

the Prophet is infallible (*ma'sūm*).¹⁵ In following lines, we would like to discuss these arguments briefly.

The exegetes of the Qur'ān (*mufasssırın*) and other scholars are basically divided into two different opinions dealing with the interpretations of the statement in the related verse: “*It is only a revelation revealed*”.¹⁶ For example, well-versed *mufasssırs* such as Ibn ‘Abbās (d. 68/687-688), al-Qatāda (d. 117/735), Muqātil (d. 150/767), Farrā (d. 207/822), Shiī mufasssır Qummī¹⁷ (d. 307/919), Tabarī (d. 310/922), Jaşşās (d. 370/981), Zamakhsharī (d. 538/1144), Baydāwī (d. 682/1283), Nasafī (d. 710/1310), ‘Ālūsī (d.1270/1854),¹⁸ Ibn Āshūr¹⁹ etc. argue that in this verse, the pronoun “*huwa*” (it) refers to the Qur’ān, not the Sunnah, because this verse was revealed to him to refuse the accusations of the idolaters that Muḥammad (pbuh) himself has fabricated the Qur’ān,²⁰ and it also indicates that the Prophet does not claim that he receives any *wahy* from Allah although he does not receive it.²¹

However, a group of commentators on the basis of this verse inclined towards the view that *wahy* (here, in the sense of prophetic inspiration) can be the source of the Sunnah. For example, by depending on this verse, Qurtubī (d. 671/1273) asserts that the source of the Sunnah is *wahy* and for him, it can be clear evidence that the individual opinions (*ijtihad*) of the Prophet regarding judicial events are not his own

¹⁴ Kırbaşođlu discussed the evidence and the opinions of Muḥammad Taqī Uthmāni and of ‘Abdulkhāliq Abdulghanī for this matter. see. Hayrī Kırbaşođlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet* (Ankara: Ankara Okulu Yayınları, 1996): 237-246.

¹⁵ Muḥammad 47: 32; al-Nūr 7: 63.

¹⁶ al-Najm 53: 3.

¹⁷ Abū al-Ḥasan ‘Ali b. İbrahim Qummī, *Tafsır al-Qur’an* (Qum: Dār al-ḥujja, 1426), 2: 311.

¹⁸ Abū al-Sanā Shehābuddīn Maḥmūd b. ‘Abdullāh Ālūsī, *Rūb al-ma’ānī* (Beirut: Dār al-fıkr, 1417/1997), 15, 72.

¹⁹ Ibn Āshūr, *Tafsır al-tahrır wa al-tamwır* (no date, no place), 8: 95.

²⁰ Elmalılı Muhammed Hamdı Yazır, *Hak Dini Kuran Dili* (no place: Eser Neşriyat, 1979), 7: 4567.

²¹ See more information Kırbaşođlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, 237-240.

decisions.²² Apart from Qurṭubī (d. 671/1273), Tha‘labī (d. 427/1035),²³ Baghawī (d. 516/1122),²⁴ Abū Ḥayyān al-Andalūsī (d. 745/1344),²⁵ Shawqānī (d. 1250/1834),²⁶ a scholar of the methodology of Islāmic Jurisprudence Ibn Ḥazm (d. 456/1063), Shenqīṭī²⁷ (d. 1373/1979), Mawdūdī (1903-1979),²⁸ and Muḥammad Muṣṭafa Zuhaylī²⁹ also stated that this verse refers to the Sunnah, not to the Qur’ān.

On the other hand, Fakhrudīn al-Rāḍī (d. 606/1209) evaluates the mentioned verse in details and indicates that here pronoun “*huwa*” can refer to both the Qur’ān and the Sunnah. But, his final analysis prefers that “*huwa*” refers to the Qur’ān.³⁰ Similarly, Turkish commentator Elmalılı Hamdi Yazır (d.1361 /1942) explains that the

²² Abū ‘Abdillāh Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Abī Bakr b. Farh Qurṭubī, *al-Jāmi li abqām al-Qur’an*, edit. Abdurrazzāq al-Ḥamdī (Beirut: Dār al-nāshr al-‘Arabī, 418/1997), 17: 45.

²³ Abū Ishāq Aḥmad b. Muḥammad b. Ibrāhīm Nīsābūrī Sa‘labī, *al-Kashf wa al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur’an/Tafsīrī’s-Sa‘labī* (Beirut: Dār ihyā turāth al-‘Arabī, 1422/2002), 9: 136. He adopted the view that related verse refers to The Qur’ān.

²⁴ Abū Muḥammad Muḥyissunna Ḥusain b. Mas‘ud al-Baghawī, *Tafsīr al-Baghawī/Maālīm al-tanzīl*. edit. Khālid ‘Abdurrahman Ak (Beirut: Dār al-ma‘rife, 1407/1987), 4: 245. According to Baghawī, this verse means “the sayings of the Prophet regarding the religion”; as for other view, it is weak.

²⁵ Andalūsī expresses that *huwa* pronoun refers to the Qur’ān see. al-Andalūsī, *al-Baḥr al-muḥīṭ*, 8: 155); but in another place, he states it means the Sunnah. Even *ḥikma*/wisdom which mentioned that it was given to the Prophet is the Sunnah and it was also descended like the Qur’ān by Allah. See. al-*Baḥr al-muḥīṭ*, Abū Ḥayyān Muḥammad b. Yūsūf b. ‘Alī b. Yūsūf b. Ḥayyān Abū Ḥayyān al-Andalūsī, *al-Baḥr al-muḥīṭ*. Beirut: Dār al-kutub al-‘ilmiyye, 1422/2001; 2: 219.

²⁶ Abū ‘Abdillāh Muḥammad b. ‘Alī b. Muḥammad al-Ḥawlanī al-Shawqānī, *Fath al-Qadir: al-Jāmi’ bayna fanni al-rivāya wa al-dirāya min ilmi al-tafsīr* (Beirut: Dār al-fikr, no date), 5: 105. Consequently he believes that the pronoun can refer to both: The Qur’ān and the Sunnah.

²⁷ Muḥammad Amīn b. Muḥammad Mukhtār al-Shenqīṭī, *Adwā al-bayān fī tẓāh al-Qur’an* (Riyāḍ: el-Maṭabiu al-ahliyya, 1983/1403), 7: 703.

²⁸ Abū A‘lā Mawdūdī, *Tafhīm al-Qur’an*, al-Najm 53: 3, footnote 4, received: 10 June 2019. [http: www.quran411.com](http://www.quran411.com)

²⁹ Wahba Zuhaylī, *Tafsīr al-munir fī al-‘aqide wa al-sharīa wa al-manhaj*, (Beirut: Dār al-fikr al-muāshir; Damascus: Dār al-fikr 1991/1411), 2: 99.

³⁰ Fahrudīn al-Rāḍī, *Mafātīḥ al-ghayb* (Beirut: Dār ihyā turāth al-‘Arabī, no date), 28: 382.

“huwa” pronoun in this verse refers to both: The Holy Qur’ān and the hadīths of the Prophet. Yet we find him inclining towards the opinion that it refers towards the Qur’ān.³¹

Therefore, those who defend that the Prophet did not make an *ijtihad*, mostly use al-Najm 53/3 which indicates that his words are *wahy*, because he does not speak of (his own) desire.³² But the other group rejects this opinion by paying attention to some other verses which warn the Prophet because of his *mis-ijtihad*s.³³ Allah also warned His messenger, when he asked Allah’s forgiveness for the *mushrikūn* (polytheists).³⁴

The scholars who claimed that the verse (al-Najm 53/3, 4) is absolute (*mutlaq*) and that it refers to the sayings of the Prophet, used it as evidence; because, according to this verse, the *ijtihad* of the Prophet is not permitted.³⁵ But Ḥanafī methodologist and jurist (*faqih*) Jaṣṣāṣ (d. 370/981) rejected this opinion that in this verse, there was no evidence

³¹ Elmalılı, *Hak Dini*, 7: 4571 Hatiboğlu says that “Huwa” pronoun in this verse certainly points to the Qur’ān. See. M. Said, Hatiboğlu, *Hız. Peygamber ve Kur’an Dışı Vahiy* (Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2009), 60.

³² al-Najm 53: 3-4.

³³ “May Allah forgive you (O Muḥammad pbuh). Why did you grant them leave (for remaining behind, you should have persisted as regards your order to them to proceed on Jihād), until those who told the truth were seen by you in a clear light, and you had known the liars?”³³ “It is not for a Prophet that he should have prisoners of war (and free them with ransom) until he had made a great slaughter (among his enemies) in the land. You desire the good of this world (i.e. the money of ransom for freeing the captives), but Allah desires (for you) the Hereafter. And Allah is All-Mighty, All-Wise” (al-Anfāl 8: 67).

³⁴ “It is not (proper) for the Prophet and those who believe to ask Allah’s Forgiveness for the mushrikūn (polytheists, idolaters, pagans, disbelievers in the Oneness of Allah) even though they be of kin, after it has become clear to them that they are the dwellers of the Fire (because they died in a state of disbelief)” (al-Tawba 8: 113).

³⁵ Ālūsī, *Ruh al-ma’ānī*, 27: 46. Abū ‘Alī al-Jubbāī and his son, Ḥāshim is among them.

to prevent the Prophet from making *ijtihad* and his *ijtihads* are results of that Allah Most High has taught and revealed to him.³⁶

As a result, the majority of the Qur'ān commentators adopted the opinion that the third and fourth verses of Najm sūrah refer to the Qur'ān. However, there are some commentators and scholars who embraced the second view. It is understood that the latter preferred the broader the meaning of this and other verses aforementioned. But this conclusion is only possible provided that the pronoun “huwa” refers to the Sunnah. But the context of these verses i.e. their precedent (*siyāq*) and the antecedent (*sibāq*), and the reason of revelation (*sabab al-nuzūl*) of this verse explicitly state that pronoun “huwa” here refers to the Qur'ān and not to the Sunnah. Hence, it is not reasonable to conclude that the source of Sunnah is *wahy* solely depending on this verse.³⁷ Nevertheless, there are some other verses in the Qur'ān referring to the sources of the Sunnah.

The second verse and evidence used by some scholars in order to prove their thesis that the Sunnah is the result of *wahy* takes place in chapter al-Baqara 2/129 and 151.³⁸ Mentioned verses indicate that The Qur'ān and wisdom (*ḥikma*) were given to the Prophet. But this evidence is also controversial. Imam al-Shāfi'ī employs other verses as well, such as Āl-i 'Imrān 3:164, Nisā 4:113, and Aḥzāb 33: 34 which declare that Allah has bestowed on His prophet the *Kitāb* and the *Ḥikma*/wisdom. According to al-Shāfi'ī, *ḥikma* is the Sunnah. By taking reference to this verse, Imam al-Shāfi'ī (d. 204/820) says: “Allah Subhānahū wa Ta'ālā

³⁶ Abū Bakr Aḥmad b. Alī Rāḍī Jassās, *Aḥqām al-Qur'ān*, edit. Muḥammad al-Ṣādiq al-Kamhawī (Beirut: Dār ihyā al-turāth al-'Arabī, 1405), 12: 265; 5: 297.

³⁷ Abū al-Faḍl Shehābuddīn Aḥmad b. Alī b. Muḥammad Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī. *Fath al-barī bi-sbarhi Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (Beirut 1996; Cairo 1978), 7: 120-125; Kırbasoğlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, p 238, 241.

³⁸ “Our Lord! Send them a Messenger from among them so that he reads your verses and teach them the Book and Wisdom, and clean them. Surely you are the Most High and Hakīm.” “Our Lord! Send amongst them a Messenger of their own (and indeed Allah answered their invocation by sending Muḥammad Peace be upon him), who shall recite unto them Your Verses and instruct them in the Book (this Qur'ān) and al-Ḥikma (full knowledge of the Islamic laws and jurisprudence or wisdom or prophet-hood), and purify them. Verily! You are the All-Mighty, the All-Wise.” (al-Baqara 2: 129, 151).

means that *book* is the Qur'ān itself and *ḥikma* refers to the Sunnah. I heard this comment from some scholars that I am sure about their knowledge on Allah's book, and I am satisfied with them; so they say that *ḥikma* is the Sunnah."³⁹

However, even though one of the meanings of *ḥikma* is the Sunnah, there are some other verses⁴⁰ containing the word *ḥikma* where it is impossible to interpret them as the Sunnah. For example, according to the majority of scholars, the term *ḥikma*, mentioned in Āl-i 'Imrān 3: 164, is separate from the Sunnah.⁴¹ Therefore, these verses show that the term *ḥikma* has a lot of meanings and it cannot be limited merely to the Sunnah.⁴² Consequently, we find some Muslim scholars introducing *ḥikma* in a wide variety of meanings. For instance, according to Muṣṭafā Sibāi, *ḥikma* means the secrets and decisions of the religions which Allah taught His Messenger,⁴³ Similarly, Şubḥī al-Şāliḥ interprets *ḥikma* as "the aims of the Islāmic *sharī'a*, its commands and secrets".⁴⁴ Kırbaşođlu shortly regards *ḥikma* as what is provided in the Qur'ān and the

³⁹ Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad b. İdrīs b. 'Abbas Şāfi'ī. *al-Risāla*, edit. Maḥmūd Matruḥī (Beirut: Dār al-fıkr, 1430/2009), 79; see also Suyūṭī, *Sünnetin Dindeki Yeri*, trans. into Turkish Enbiya Yıldırım (Istanbul: Rağbet Yayınları, 2000), 21-22 (quoted from *al-Faqıh wa mutaḥaqıqıh*, 1: 87). Muṣṭafā Sibāi, embraces the same opinion. see Sibāi, *al-Sunnah wa makānatuhā fi al-tasbrü al-Islāmi*, 51. He says: al-A'rāf 7: 157 reveals that alongside the Qur'ān, another thing (the Sunnah), which is obligatory to follow, should be given to the Prophet. As mentioned clearly in the following Ḥadīth: "...Beware! 'Indeed I have been given the Book (that is, the Qur'ān) and something like it along with it..." (Abū Dāwūd, "Sunnah", 6; Tirmidzī, "İlm", 10; Ibn Māja, "Muqaddima", 2; Ibn Hibbān, *Şahih*, 1: 107; Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, *al-Kifāya*, 39).

⁴⁰ For example Āl-i 'Imrān 3: 48 is about the Prophet Jesus; In the Chapter Loqmān verse 12 emphasised that Allah gave *ḥikma* to Loqmān (pbuh).

⁴¹ Sibāi, *al-Sunnah wa makānatuhā fi al-tasbrü al-Islāmi*, 50.

⁴² Kırbaşođlu, *İslām Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, 246 (Suyūṭī, *al-Itqān*, I, 36; quoted from 'Amidī, *al-Ihkām*, 2: 218-222). Thus Kırbaşođlu interpreted *ḥikma* as what we obtained the principles and teachings from Qur'ān. See. Kırbaşođlu, *İslām Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, 246.

⁴³ Sibāi, *al-Sunna wa mekānatuhā fi tasbrü al-Islāmi*, 49.

⁴⁴ Şubḥī al-Şāliḥ. *Ulüm al-ḥadīth wa muṣṭalahub* (Beirut: Dār al-İlm li al-malayin, 1977), 1: 303.

principles and teachings that we obtain from Qur'ān.⁴⁵ Therefore, taking into consideration of all other verses containing *ḥikma*, it can be interpreted as a *firāsah* and an ability of choosing the best.

Another verse which is used as evidence that the Sunnah is part of revelation takes place in Chapter al-Ḥashr 59:7 “... *Whatsoever the Messenger (Muḥammad pbuh) gives you, take it, and whatsoever he forbids you, abstain (from it)...*” When we notice the precedent (*siyāq*) and the antecedent (*sibāq*) of this verse, i.e. the context of this verse, we see that it is about the distribution of “*fay*” (booty). However, the only opinion on this issue is not what we have mentioned above, because some of the commentators, -even though they are minority- , such as Suddī (d. 122/774) and Ḥasan al-Baṣrī (d. 110/728) embarrassed another opinion that this verse (al-Ḥashr 59: 7) concerns the booty.⁴⁶

Nevertheless, there are some scholars who do not agree with the idea that the verse refers to only ‘fay’, because they argue that the particularity of the reason of a verse does not preclude the universality of its command and *ḥukm*.⁴⁷ Some commentators such as Ibn Jurayj (d. 50/767), a Shīī mufassir Ṭabarsī (d. 548/1153),⁴⁸ Qurṭubī (d. 671/1273),⁴⁹ Ibn al-‘Arabī (d. 638/1240),⁵⁰ Mawdūdī (1903-1979),⁵¹ Elmalılı (d. 1361 /1942),⁵² Ṭāhīr b. Āshūr (d. 1393/1973)⁵³ and Shenqīṭī

⁴⁵ Kırbaçoğlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, 246.

⁴⁶ Qurṭubī, *Tafsīr*, 17: 18.

⁴⁷ See for discussions: Kırbaçoğlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, 249.

⁴⁸ Abū ‘Alī Amīnuddīn Faḍl b. Ḥasan b. Faḍl Ṭabarsī, *Majma al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur’an* (Beirut: Muassasa al-‘ilām li’l-maṭbuāt, 1215/1995), 9: 432.

⁴⁹ Abū ‘Abdillāh Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Abī Bakr b. Farh Qurṭubī, *al-Jāmi’ li ahqāmī’l-Qur’an*, edit. ‘Abdurrazzāq al-Ḥamdī (Beirut: Dār al-nāshir al-‘Arabī, 418/1997), 17: 18-20. Qurṭubī, evaluates the evidence from the Qur’ān and hadīths in details. *ibid*.

⁵⁰ Abū ‘Abdillah Muḥyiddīn Ibn al-‘Arabī, *Tafsīr al-Qur’an al-Karīm* (Beirut: Dār yaqāza al-‘Arabiyya, 1968), 2: 1280.

⁵¹ Mawdūdī, *Tafhīm al-Qur’an*, al-Ḥashr 59: 7, footnote 15, received: 10 June 2019 www.quran411.com

⁵² Elmalılı, *Hak Dini*, 7: 4836-4837.

⁵³ Ibn Āshūr, *Tafsīr al-tahrīr wa al-tanwīr*, 8: 99.

(d. 1373/1979),⁵⁴ etc. indicate that the scope of this verse is general and it includes whole orders of the Messenger, even though it was revealed about the distribution of “fay” (booty) because of a famous methodological principle aforementioned above. Consequently, according to these commentators, whatever the Prophet ordered, it should be adopted and whatever he forbade, it should also be abstained from. Moreover, this verse (al-Ḥaṣhr 59: 7) is among verses used by some scholars about the authority of the Sunnah. For example, when Imam al-Shāfi‘ī visited Mecca, Meccan people gathered around him and he said: “I will give answer to all of your questions by referring only to the Qur’ān.” When people asked al-Shāfi‘ī some questions whose answers don’t take place in the Qur’ān, he answered them by transmitting *marfu‘* (raised ḥadīth) and even *maqtu‘* ḥadīths (cut-off ḥadīth), because according to him, whatever the Prophet ordered, it should be adopted and whatever he forbade, it should also be abstained from.⁵⁵ For him, whatever the Prophet commands, it is actually the command of Allah and whatever the Prophet forbids, it is the forbidding of Allah as well.

Furthermore, in order to prove their opinions, the scholars taking place in this group use some ḥadīths indicating that the Prophet received some kind of *wahys* (prophetic inspiration, *al-wahy al-ghayr al-mathmū‘/al-wahy al-bātin*) apart from the Qur’ān. One of them is: “Beware! *Indeed I have been given the Book (that is, the Qur’ān) and something like it along with it...*”⁵⁶ So Suyūṭī even reports a tradition that Gabriel used to descent with the Sunnah just as he descended with the Qur’ān.⁵⁷ The other example is the Jibrīl ḥadīth,⁵⁸ which indicates that “Allah gave to

⁵⁴ Shenqīṭī, *Adwā al-Qur’ān*, 8: 62.

⁵⁵ Shenqīṭī, *Adwā al-Qur’ān*, 8: 62.

⁵⁶ Abū Dāwūd, “Sunnah”, 6; Tirmidzī, “‘Ilm”, 6; Ibn Māja, “Muqaddima”, 2; Ibn Ḥibbān, *al-Ihsān fī tartīb Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān bi tartīb Ali b. Belban* (Beirut: 1988), 1: 94; Khatīb al-Baghādāī, *al-Kifāye*, 1: 59.

⁵⁷ Abū al-Faḍl Jalāleddīn ‘Abdurrahman b. Abī Bakr Suyūṭī, *al-Itqān fī ‘ulūm al-Qur’ān*, edit. Muḥammad Abū al-Faḍl İbrahim, (Hey’et al-Miṣriyya al-amma li’l-kitāb, 1394/1974), 1: 159; Dārimī, “Muqaddima”, 48.

⁵⁸ Muslim, “İmān”, 1 -9.

His messenger the Qur'ān and something like it"⁵⁹ and some other *qudsī ḥadīths*, starting with phrases such as: "Allah informed me that" or "Allah revealed me and inspired me..." or "Gabriel warned me", reveal that the Prophet received a kind of *wahy* apart from the Qur'ān.

The statement of "something like it" (misl): in ḥadīth mentioned above can be interpreted in two different ways:

- i. Allah revealed him *al-wahy al-zāhir/al-wahy al-matluw* that is al-Qur'ān, and *al-wahy al-bātin*/the *ghayr-i matluw wahy*,
- ii. Beside *al-wahy al-matluw* (the Qur'ān), Allah gave him the mission of the explanation of the Qur'ān, and an authority to apply the general rules into specific cases. He can give new orders which do not directly take place in the Qur'ān. Hence, to obey these rules determined by the Sunnah is like to obey the Qur'ān.⁶⁰

This ḥadīth also criticizes those who embrace just the *zāhir* of the Qur'ān and ignore the Prophetic Sunnah which explains the verses of the Qur'ān. It can be mentioned as an example of the understanding of some non-orthodox and extremely marginal sects such as Khawārij and Rafiqa in this context.

Bayhaqī (d. 458/1066) interpreted the statement of "its similar" means ḥadīths, that is *al-wahy al-bātin*, the Sunnah explains it, generalizes and/or specifies its some provisions and adds some new rules on it.⁶¹ Azimābādī (d. 1329/1911) the interpreter of Abū Dāwūd's *Sunan*, shares the same opinion as well.

In addition to these, we see Ibn Kathīr (d. 774/1373) citing a narration from Abū Dāwūd (d. 496/1103) in the commentary of al-Najm 53: 4 that says: 'Abdullah b. 'Amr (d. 65/684-85) used to write down every talk he heard from the Prophet, but some people from the tribe of Quraysh advised him not to record all his sayings, because the Prophet is

⁵⁹ Abū Dāwūd, 'Sunnah' 5; Tirmizī, "Ilm", 10.

⁶⁰ Abū Sulaimān Ḥamd b. Muḥammad Khaṭṭābī, *Maalim al-sunan maa Mundbri's Mukhtaṣar* (Beirut: Dār al-ma'rifa, 1980), 4: 299.

⁶¹ Abū al-Ṭayyib Muḥammad Shams al-Ḥaq b. Amīr 'Alī Diyānuwī 'Azimābādī, 'Aḥwāl al-Ma'būd sharh Sunan Abī Dāwūd, edit. Abdurrahman Muḥammad Uthmān, Muḥammad Abdulmuḥsin Kebtī (Madina: el-Maktaba al-salafiyya, 1969/1389), 12: 231.

a human being: So, he stopped writing, and mentioned it to the Messenger of Allah. By declaring “*Write, by Him in Whose hand my soul lies, only right comes out from it*” (gesturing to his mouth)⁶² the Prophet allowed him to record ḥadīths he heard.

Moreover Bazzār (d. 65 / 684-85) and Musaddad (d. 228/843) transmitted a ḥadīth in their books on the authority of Abū Hurayra (d. 58/678) that the Prophet states that “*No doubt that what I informed you is from Allah Most High.*”⁶³ Considering these opinions and narrations quoted by Ibn Kathīr,⁶⁴ we can say that Ibn Kathīr leaned towards the opinion that the source of the Sunnah is *wahy* (*al-wahy al-bātin*).

Apart from Imam al-Shāfi‘ī and Ibn Kathīr, there are some scholars such as, Ibn Ḥibbān (d. 354/965)⁶⁵ and Ibn Ḥazm (d. 456/1063)⁶⁶ who defend that the sayings of the Prophet and his actions depend on *wahy* and that he is under the supervision of divine teachings. Accordingly, they agree with the view that the source of the Sunnah is *wahy*, taking into reference the above-mentioned verses and ḥadīths; so much so that Imam al-Shāfi‘ī defends that the source of the Prophet’s words and deeds (The Sunnah) is the Qur’ān itself, and the Sunnah explains the Qur’ān. For that reason, the Sunnah is actually an order of Allah or an inspiration (*ilbām*) from Allah or an authority given him by Allah.⁶⁷ Similarly, Ibn Qutaiba (d. 276/889) argues that Gabriel brought the Sunnah to the Prophet just as he brought the Qur’ān to him.⁶⁸ Ibn

⁶² Abū Dāwūd, “‘Ilm”, 3.

⁶³ Ibn Ḥanbal, *Musnad*, 2, 340.

⁶⁴ Ibn Kathīr, *Tafsīr*, 4, 248.

⁶⁵ Ibn Ḥibbān, *al-Iḥsān fī tartīb Ṣaḥīḥ-i Ibn Ḥibbān*, 1: 89.

⁶⁶ Abū Muḥammad b. Ali b. Aḥmad b. Saīd al-zāhiri Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Iḥqām fī uṣūl al-bqām* (Beirut 1403/1983), 1: 96-97.

⁶⁷ Abū Abdillāh Muḥammad b. Idrīs b. ‘Abbās al-Shāfi‘ī, *al-Umm*, edit. Muḥammad Zuhrī en-Najjār. Beirut: no date, edit. ‘Ali Muḥammad, ‘Adil Aḥmad; sharīk fī-t-tahqīq Aḥmad Īsā Ḥasan Ma’sarawī (Beirut: Dār iḥyā al-turāth al-‘Arabī, 2001/1422), 5: 128; İbrahim Canan, *Hız: Peygamber’in Sünnetinde Tıp*, (Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 1995), 258.

⁶⁸ Abū Muḥammad ‘Abdullah b. Muslim b. Kutaiba al-Dīnawarī Ibn Kutaiba, *Ta’wīlu mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* (al-Maktab al-Islāmī 1419/1999), 282.

‘Abdilbar (d. 463/1071) mentions those who share the same opinion of Ibn Kutaiba.⁶⁹

On the other hand, the opinion of al-Shāfi‘ī and of others who embraced that the source of the Sunnah is *wahy* was rejected by some scholars, because of some divine warnings in the Qur’ān⁷⁰ about the mistakes of prophetic *ijtihad*s. In other words, if the Sunnah had been a result of *wahy*, it would not have been corrected by the *wahy* of the Qur’ān.⁷¹ But, some scholars explained these warnings concern his mis-*ijtihad*s as to teach a prophetic method for both scholars and ordinary people, and for both presidents and shepherds, shortly for all the Ummah.⁷² Furthermore, ḥadīth sources contain some narrations which indicate that the Prophet can make mistakes about worldly affairs.⁷³

Besides, depending on these evidence, they paid attention that in Islāmic fiqh, the source of the following decisions is just the Sunnah: the times of the prayers, the numbers of their *rak‘ats*, the Jumua’ prayer, the traveller prayer, some decisions about inheritance, prohibition of eating the flesh of domestic donkey/mule, the fanged beasts of prey and birds with a talon, the cleanness of sea water and lawfulness of eating the sea products and *naqf* foundation.

⁶⁹ Abū Bakr Aḥmad b. ‘Alī b. Sābit Khaṭīb el-Baḡhdādī, *Jamī li akhlāq al-rāwī*, edit. Abū Abdillāh al-Surqī, Ibrahim Ḥamdī al-Madanī (Beirut: Muassasa al-risāle, 1991), 1: 12.

⁷⁰ “It is not for a Prophet that he should have prisoners of war (and free them with ransom) until he had made a great slaughter (among his enemies) in the land. You desire the good of this world (i.e. the money of ransom for freeing the captives), but Allah desires (for you) the Hereafter. And Allah is All-Mighty, All-Wise.” al-Anfāl 8: 67; al-Tawba 9: 43.

⁷¹ Kırbāşođlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, 279.

⁷² Canan, *Hız Peygamber’in Sünnetinde Tıp*, 258.

⁷³ “Rafī b. Khadij reported that Allah's Messenger came to Medina and the people had been grafting the trees. He said: What are you doing? They said: We are grafting them, whereupon he said: It may perhaps be good for you if you do not do that, so they abandoned this practice (and the date-palms) began to yield less fruit. They made a mention of it (to the Holy Prophet), whereupon he said: I am a human being, so when I command you about a thing pertaining to religion, do accept it, and when I command you about a thing out of my personal opinion, keep it in mind that I am a human being.” Muslim “Faḍāil”, 38.

1.2. Those Who Defend That Some Parts of the Sunnah Depend on the Wahy and Their Evidence

Most scholars take place in this group such as Shāṭibī (d. 790/1388), Shah Waliyyullāh al-Dehlawī (d. 1239/1824), ‘Abdulazīm al-Zurqānī (d. 1367/1948), ‘Abdulghanī ‘Abdulkhāliq, Ali Toksarı and Mevlüt Güngör. For them, the Sunnah is partly the product of revelation, because, there are some verses and ḥadīths implying that the Prophet received some *wahy* along with the Qur’ān. But, in this part, we will point out only what the most commonly used ones are.⁷⁴

It is worth to note that the main problem in this issue is the difficulty in determining which sort of ḥadīth or Sunnah depend on *wahy*, and the second one is the problem of verifying their authenticity. We know that the narrations reaching us are generally *ahād* (rare) ḥadīths, involving suspicion due to the inadequacy in the chain of transmission and number of transmitter’s chain. In the following lines, we will discuss the evidences of this group.

To start with, Muslims used to observe their prayers towards al-Masjid al-Aqsā in the Meccan period and even after their *hijra* (*migration*) to Madina about seventeen months before the *qiblah* diverted towards Ka’ba through a verse (al-Baqara 2: 143-145).⁷⁵ The verse explains the reason as: “*In order to test believers and to distinguish those who followed the Messenger from those who would turn on their heels (i.e. disobey the Messenger).*” The most interesting point is that Allah attributed the previous order to the Prophet; but in the Qur’ān, no verse referring to the former command about the first *qiblah* determined by Allah as al-Masjid al-Aqsā.⁷⁶ It is understood that Allah Himself determined it by sending a

⁷⁴ See for more information Keleş, “Sünnet Vahiy İlişkisi”, p 167-169.

⁷⁵ “...And We made the Qiblah (prayer direction towards Jerusalem) which you used to face, only to test those who followed the Messenger (Muḥammad pbuh) from those who would turn on their heels (i.e. disobey the Messenger). Indeed it was great (heavy) except for those whom Allah guided. And Allāh would never make your faith (prayers) to be lost (i.e. your prayers offered towards Jerusalem). Truly, Allāh is full of kindness, the Most Merciful towards mankind.” al-Baqara 143-145.

⁷⁶ Muḥammad Taqī Uthmānī, *Sünnetin Bağlayıcılığı*. trans. into Turkish İbrahim Kutluay (İstanbul: Rağbet Yayınları, 2017), 30-31.

wahy (*al-wahy al-bāṭin*) to his Prophet which does not appear in The Qur'ān. Apart from this, in this context, some other evidences from the Qur'ān are also employed by the scholars that the Prophet received some *wahys* along with the Qur'ān.⁷⁷

In this case, some ḥadīths are also used as evidence such as the Prophet said that “the Angel Gabriel inspired to me that one does not pass away unless he completed his livelihood (*riḥq*)”,⁷⁸ the recommendation of Gabriel to the Prophet about neighbors' rights insistently,⁷⁹ the instructing on how the prayer and *wuḍū' are* observed,⁸⁰ and for the beginning and ending times of the daily prayers etc.⁸¹ Therefore, Mawdūdī says that no reason and logic accept that a person was sent as a prophet by Allah and then he was absolutely free in carrying out his mission depending on just his own individual opinion and understanding. Even, a simple government gives some specific orders to its ambassador and certainly inspects his actions, sometimes need to warn it and gives new tactics.⁸² Similarly, according to Muḥammad Ḥamīdullāh (d. 2002), the relationship between the Qur'ān and Sunnah is quite natural and normal. Because according to tradition and the judicial understanding, an envoy or an ambassador represents his sender and is regarded just as him. Also, the sayings of an envoy or of an ambassador are regarded as the words of his government. The same rationale is applicable for the position of the Prophet. According to 'Abdulḡhanī 'Abdulkhālīq, the confirmation of Allah about the Sunnah of the Prophet shows how appropriate and true they are, such

⁷⁷ al-Aḡzāb 33: 37; al-Ḥaṡhr 59: 5; see the evaluation of the verses used as evidence for the Prophet received wahy apart from the Qur'ānic wahy. Kırbāsođlu, *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, p 286-287.

⁷⁸ Shāfi'ī, *al-Risāla*, 79.

⁷⁹ Bukhārī, “Adab”, 28; Muslim, “Birr”, 140; Ibn Māja, “Adab”, 4; *Musnad*, 2: 85, 160; 5: 22; 6: 52. Ibn Ḥibbān, *Ṣaḡīḡ*, 1: 365.

⁸⁰ *Musnad*, 4: 161.

⁸¹ Abū Dāwūd, “Salāt”, 2; Tirmidzī, “Mawāqit”, 1.

⁸² Abū A'lā Mawdūdī, *Sünnetin Anayasal Niteliđi*, trans. N. Ahmet Asrar (İstanbul: Bengisu, 1997), 261-262.

confirmation can, therefore, be regarded as a kind of *wahy*; just as the confirmation of the Messenger is considered as a part of His Sunnah.⁸³

Nawawī (d. 676/1277) the interpreter of Imam Muslim's *al-Şahih*, reveals his own opinion on the authority of the Sunnah through the subtitle thirty-eighth of the Chapter *Faḍāil*, in Muslim's *al-Şahih*, there he divides *wahy* into two kinds. According to Nawawī, what the Prophet carried out as *al-din* are the result of *wahy*, but his actions regarding worldly affairs are not. So, we have to obey what the Prophet established as a *Şaria*; on the contrary, it is not compulsory to obey what he said about worldly affairs.⁸⁴

Some scholars study the question of *al-wahy al-ghayr matluw* within the framework of the knowledge of the Prophet about *ghayb* (unseen), because accordingly, the source of some ḥadīths revealing the events that will occur in the future should be *al-wahy ghayr al-matluw*. Ḥadīth scholars have reported what the Prophet informed about future and mentioned such prophecies exist in some chapters such as “Bad’u’l-khalq” (starting of the creation) and “Fitān, Malāḥim” (seditions and epics) in canonic ḥadīth books.⁸⁵ Although the authenticity of these ḥadīths is a controversial issue, there are abundant examples of it in ḥadīth books. We know that a lot of narrations prove that the means of knowledge of the Prophet are not limited to just the five senses and reason. However, it is understood by means of some related verses and ṣaḥīḥ ḥadīth that the knowledge of the Prophet about *ghayb*, *qiyāmah*/the resurrection day and future is just limited to what Allah has revealed him.⁸⁶

⁸³ Abdulghanī Abdulkhāliq, *Ḥujjīyya al-Sunnah* (Riyadh: al-Dār al-ālamīyya li’l-kitāb al-Islāmī, 1415/1995), 222.

⁸⁴ Muslim, “Faḍāil”, 38.

⁸⁵ Mehmet Emin Özaşar, “Hadisçilerin Peygamber Tasavvuru/Anlayışı”, *Diyānet İlmî Dergî [Diyānet İşleri Reisliği Yıllığı] Peygamberimiz Hz. Muhammed (SAV)*, Özel Sayı (2000, 2003): 318, 319.

⁸⁶ Bünyamin Erul, “Harput’lu Abdulhamit Hamdi Efendi (1830-1902) ve Hz. Peygamber’in Bilgisine Dair Bir Risalesi”, *Fırat Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, issue/sayı: 6 (2001): 15-16. Erul, “Hz. Peygamber’e Kur’an Dışında Vahiy Geldiğini İfade Eden Rivāyetlerin Tahlil ve Tenkidi”, *İslāmīyāt I*, issue: 1 (1998): 55-72.

By the way, Muslim scholars, who assert that the Sunnah is the result of *wahy*, do not reject the function of the Prophetic *ijtihāds*; according to them, even the Messenger of Allah can also make mistakes in his *ijtihāds*. As Imam al-Sarakhsī mentioned, no mistake of the Prophet is ignored in religious affairs and *ahkām*, rather Allah rectifies it and immediately warns his messenger.⁸⁷

1.3. Scholars Who Put Forward That the Prophet Did Not Receive But al-*Wahy al-Matluw*

The scholars taking place in this group collected their arguments in three different ways:

- i. The Qur'ān constantly stresses out that the Prophet is a human being,⁸⁸
- ii. In practice, the Prophet has made some mistakes and forgotten some things, so much so that Allah warned him,⁸⁹
- iii. Had the Sunnah been the result of *wahy*, it would have been protected by Allah like the Qur'ān that He promised to protect.

Some contemporary scholars from Indo-Pak sub-continent such as Sir Sayyid Aḥmad Khān (d. 1817/1898), Sayyid Amir Ali (d. 1347/1923), Gulam Aḥmad Parwiz (d. 1405/1985), Nadwī (1884-1953); and others from Egypt named as Tawfīk Ṣīdqi (d. 1338/1920), Abū Rayya (d. 1390/1970)⁹⁰, Ṣubḥī al-Ṣāliḥ (d. 1407/1986),⁹¹ Abduljalīl 'Īsā and M. Said Hatiboğlu⁹² etc. put forward that the Prophet did not receive any *wahy* except the Qur'ān. According to them, the source of the Sunnah is the Qur'ān. For Nadwī, the provisions (*ahkām*) announced via authentic/*ṣaḥīḥ* ḥadīths were generated from the Qur'ān and they were

⁸⁷ Sarakhsī, *Uṣūl al-Sarakhsī*, 1: 18.

⁸⁸ al-Kahf, 18:110; al-Isrā 17:93.

⁸⁹ See Muslim, "Faḍāil", 140-141; Ibn Māja, "Ruhūn", 15.

⁹⁰ Abū Rayya, *Adwā alā al-Sunnah al-Muḥammadiyya aw dīfā' an al-Ḥadīth* (Beirut: Muassasa ālami al-maṭbuat, no date), 38-40.

⁹¹ Ṣubḥī al-Ṣāliḥ, *'Ulūm al-ḥadīth wa muṣtalāḥuh*, Dār malāyīn 1: 302.

⁹² Hatiboğlu argues that there is no revelation other than Qur'ān. *Hız. Peygamber ve Kur'an Dışı Vahiy*, 63.

istinbats (inductions) of the Prophets who extracted them from the Qur'ān. Hence, if these ahādīth are authentic and certain, we have to obey these *ahkām*.⁹³

Some contemporary scholars indicate that The Qur'ān depends completely on the revelation/ *wahy*, but the source of the Sunnah is inspiration. For example, Subhī al-Sālīh claims that those who state that the source of some parts of the Sunnah is *wahy*, their usage *wahy* term refers solely to the *wahy* of the Qur'ān, not to any other kind of *wahy*.⁹⁴ This point is very important.

Turkish scholar Said Hatiboğlu, whose name was mentioned above, seems to be one of those who do not accept the Sunnah as the result of *wahy*. He says when we analyse some verses of the Qur'ān about the Messenger of Allah carefully; we obviously realize that the Messenger of Allah is deprived of receiving knowledge about *ghayb*/unseen, which depends on human senses. For that reason, The Prophet cannot know an incident which occurred somewhere which is far from him and out of sight. Because considering that he used spies and he inquired about reporting, such as his behaviour in *Ifk* case, shows that the Messenger of Allah does not know unseen. For example, the intention of the assassination of Jews about him was informed to him by a Muslim who learned it somehow earlier. Another example: there was a secret between his two wives, who promised to reveal nobody, but when the Prophet learnt it somehow, they were in shock. Hatiboğlu argues that this secret can be informed to him by somebody, though the Prophet declares that his Lord informed him. Although the Prophet attributed it to Allah; however he probably learnt it from anybody. We see, Hatiboğlu says, this kind of usage in the Qur'ān, for instance concerning the Battle of Badr, Allah says: “...*You did not throw, but we did*”, whereas the Muslims threw arrows against idolaters.⁹⁵

⁹³ Sayyid Sulaimān al-Nadwī, *Tabḥīq ma'na al-sunnah wa bayān al-hāja ilayhā*, trans. into Arabic Abdulwahhāb al-Dehlawī (Cairo: al-Maṭbaa al-salafiyya, 1399), 17-18.

⁹⁴ Şubhī al-Sālīh, ‘*Ulum al-hadīth wa mustalahub*, 1: 302.

⁹⁵ Hatiboğlu, “Kur'ān ve Sünnet Işığında Hz. Peygamber'in Gayba Muttali Olması Meselesi”, 25-27.

Other evidence used by these scholars is that the Prophet did not rebuild the Ka'ba by erecting it on original fundamentals; because his tribe Quraysh was not ready for it. Another example is that the Messenger of Allah thought to ban Muslim couples from committing sexual relationships during the period in which wife was breast-feeding her baby, because the Prophet supposed that it could be harmful for babies; but when he learned that it is not the case through the examples of Byzantine people and Persians, he allowed.⁹⁶

1.4. Assessment of these Arguments

Taking into account the verses stating that Allah revealed Mary and the Apostles, whether we consider the word *wahy* in these verses as a known *wahy* or *ilhām*/inspiration, we cannot consider that the Prophet was deprived of taking this kind of *wahy* or inspiration apart from the Qur'ān. Furthermore, there is no reason to overrule much evidence mentioned above. On the other hand, those who claim that whatever the Prophet utters, it depends on *wahy*, wanted to justify their opinion with some verses, but the *sabab al-nuzūl* of these verses, their context, and the Prophet having been warned and corrected in the Qur'ān due to some cases where he committed mistake, and the experiences of the Prophet in his life show that their opinion is not correct.

In our opinion, the comments of Şubhī al-Şālih, and Hatiboğlu mentioned above are quite subjective; because there are so many examples in ḥadīth collections concerning Allah informed his Messenger via *wahy ghayr al-matlum* that they cannot be interpreted differently. Also, the narrations indicating that the Prophet received *wahy* apart from the Qur'ān are so much that to deny them is almost impossible. Also, to understand or interpret them in a different way such as to say that they refer to the *wahy* of the Qur'ān means acting arbitrarily and destroying the meaning of the text. No Muslim scholar from the forebears commented these verses and ḥadīths which refer to the *wahy* of the Qur'ān.

On the other hand, to claim that the Sunnah is completely the result of *wahy* is an overstatement ignoring the reality that the Prophet was a human being, which the Qur'ān reminds it because there are some

⁹⁶ Abū Dāwūd, “Ṭib” 14; Muslim, “Nikāḥ”, 11.

actions of the Prophet, based on his own individual opinion, and he made some mistakes in some of his *ijtihāds* and consequently, he was warned by Allah. All of these proofs show that his all actions and sayings concerning worldly affairs were not the result of *wahy*. However, it is certain that he was under control of *wahy* in religious affairs. As for worldly affairs, surely, the Messenger of Allah has gone through a revolutionary training during his prophet hood; so he knew the character of the *wahy*, the divine purpose of the revealed, and what earns the pleasure of Allah; thus he would not act against the pleasure of Allah.

2. The Classification of Wahy and the Sunnah

Keeping the relationship between *wahy* and the Sunnah, and other ways of revelation in our minds,⁹⁷ in this section, I will briefly evaluate some theoretical debates on *wahy* and what kind of consequences these three different views caused. Imam al-Shāfi'ī (d. 204/820), Ibn Hibbān (d. 354/965),⁹⁸ Khaṭṭābī (d. 388/998),⁹⁹ Ibn Ḥazm (d. 456/1063),¹⁰⁰ Ghazzālī (d. 505/1111),¹⁰¹ Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505),¹⁰² Shah Waliyyullāh al-Dehlawī (d. 1239/1824) and so on, divided the revelation into two parts: *Wahy al-matluw* (which is miraculous and recited in the prayer, its words and meanings belong to Allah) and *wahy ghayr al-matluw* (*risālat* and *ilhām*/inspiration).¹⁰³ Other terms of *wahy* are outward (*ẓāhirī*)

⁹⁷ “It is not given to any human being that Allah should speak to him unless (it be) by Revelation, or from behind a veil, or (that) He sends a Messenger to reveal what He wills by His Leave. Verily, He is Most High, Most.” al-Shuarā 42: 51.

⁹⁸ Shāfi'ī, *al-Umm*, 5: 127-128.

⁹⁹ Khaṭṭābī, *Ma' alim al-sunan*, 7: 7-8.

¹⁰⁰ Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Ihkām*, 1: 93.

¹⁰¹ Abū Ḥamīd Ḥujjat al-Islām Muḥammad b. Muḥammad al-Ghazzālī, *al-Mustaṣfā min 'ilm al-uṣūl*, dirāse ve taḥqīq Ḥamza b. Zuhayr Ḥāfız (Jidda: al-Sharika al-Madina al-Munawwara li't-tibaa wa al-nashr, no date), 1: 129.

¹⁰² Shenqitī, *Adwā' al-bayān*, 8: 61.

¹⁰³ The Qur'an mentions that Allah inspired to not only the Prophet, but also the bee (“And your Lord inspired the bees, saying: “Take you habitations in the mountains and in the trees and in what they erect” (al-Nahl 16: 68), and to apostle of Jesus, “And when I (Allah) revealed Al-Hawariyyun (the disciples) [of 'Isā (Jesus)] to believe in Me and My Messenger, they said: “We believe. And bear witness that we are Muslims.” (al-Māida 5: 111),

wahy and inward (bātini) wahy.¹⁰⁴ Accordingly, the Qur’ān is *matluw wahy*, and the Sunnah is *ghayr-i matluw wahy*. Even, at this point, Mawdūdī stated that the source of the words of the Prophet related to religion is *al-wahy al-khafī*.¹⁰⁵

For this reason, Imam al-Awzaī (d. 157/774) argued that if there is a ḥadīth in any judicial matter, we cannot follow other opinions.¹⁰⁶ According to Imam al-Shāfi‘ī, the Sunnah is an explanation of the Qur’ān; he added that the source of this explanation occurs through the *risālat* coming from Allah, or *ilhām*/inspiration or an order given to the Prophet.¹⁰⁷ Hence, it appears that he adopted the view that the Sunnah is a kind of *wahy*. In this issue Imam al-Awzaī and Imam al-Shāfi‘ī are not alone. Some other scholars also argued that the Prophet received some *wahy* apart from the Qur’ān,¹⁰⁸ and along with the Qur’ān how some terms such as *dzīker*, *hukm*, and *hikma* refer to the function of the Prophet in the religion. It is impossible to claim that the Prophet carried out the duty of the explanation (*bayān*) as independent from the *wahy*. Thus, it is understood from these verses and evidence that Prophetic Sunnah is compulsory in the application of the Qur’ān as a life system.

to the mother of Moses “*And We inspired the mother of Mūsā (Moses), (telling): "Suckle him [Mūsā (Moses)], but when you fear for him, then cast him into the river and fear not, nor grieve. Verily! We shall bring him back to you, and shall make him one of (Our) Messengers."* (al-Qaṣaṣ 28: 7), to the mother of Jesus, Mary: “*She said: "O my Lord! How shall I have a son when no man has touched me? He said: "So (it will be) for Allah creates what He wills. When He has decreed something, He says to it only: "Be!" - and it is"* (Āl-i ‘Imrān 3: 47); and heavens (“*Then He completed and finished from their creation (as) seven heavens in two Days and He made in each heaven its affair...*” (al-Fuṣṣilat 41:12). The Prophet, who received the highest kind of wahy (wahy al-matluw), can also receive *wahy ghayr al-matluw* in some circumstances and times that Allah willed, and He can inform him some matters and questions which do not take place in the Qur’ān. Keleş, “Sünnet Vahiy İlişkisi”, Ahmet Keleş, “Sunnet Vahiy İlişkisi”, *Dicle Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*. vol. I (1999): 165; Salih Karacabey, *Nebevi ve Beşeri Bilgi*, 180.

¹⁰⁴ Khattābī, *Ma’alim al-sunan*, 2: 7-8.

¹⁰⁵ Mawdūdī, *Tafhim al-Qur’ān*, al-Najm 53: 3, footnote 4. Received: 10 June 2019. www.quran411.com

¹⁰⁶ Abdulghanī, *Hujjiya al-sunnah*, 338.

¹⁰⁷ Shāfi‘ī, *al-Risāla*, 154; Shāfi‘ī, *al-Umm*, 5: 128.

¹⁰⁸ Suyūṭī, *al-Itqān*, 197-198.

A number of scholars classified the Sunnah according to its source, in two or three classes. For example, Ibn Qutaiba (d. 276/889) regarded it into three groups:

i) The Sunnah which was brought by the Angel Gabriel from Allah.

ii) Another part is what Allah gave the permission to His Prophet to lay down the Sunnah ordering him to use his reason, and the Prophet has taken the wisdom and necessity into account in his rulings in that category.

iii) Some acts of the Prophet which he taught us as the Sunnah; if we do them we can take reward, but if we leave them we are not inquired so as we abandon them.¹⁰⁹

Another scholar Khaṭṭābī (d. 388/998) stressed that all information regarding the prophet hood mission is based on *wahy*; since, it is impossible to learn them by means of only experience and *ijtibad*. According to him, as we mentioned before, “*I have been given the Qur’ān and also its like*” in this ḥadīth, the statement “Its like” refers to the Sunnah.¹¹⁰ Upon this, it can be said that Khaṭṭābī adopted the view that the source of the Sunnah is *wahy*. Moreover, it is understood that Khaṭṭābī evaluated ḥadīths in two different categories: First, the ḥadīths which were said by the Messenger of Allah to explain the religion.¹¹¹ Second, the ḥadīths in worldly matters.¹¹² However, it should not be forgotten that the content of ḥadīth in worldly affairs can include religious matters and vice versa.

¹⁰⁹ Ibn Kutaiba, *Ta’wīl mukhtalif al-ḥadīth*, 196-198

¹¹⁰ Khaṭṭābī, *Maalim al-sunan*, 5: 2, 7-8.

¹¹¹ “With clear signs and Books (We sent the Messengers). And We have also sent down unto you (O Muḥammad pbuh) the Dhikr [the reminder and the advice (the Qur’ān)], that you may explain clearly to men what is sent down to them, and that they may give thought.” al-Naḥl 16: 44. In this verse “the duty of explaining” is a stress on His role.

¹¹² Salih Karacabey, “Hadis Vahiy Münasebeti ve Tıpla İlgili Hadisler Hakkında Hattābī’nin Görüşleri”, *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, vol. 4, issue: 4 (1992): 219-220.

Notwithstanding, Khaṭṭābī also points out the human side of the Prophet and acknowledges that the Prophet can make mistakes in his *ijtihad*s in worldly affairs, since he is also a human being. Khaṭṭābī, therefore, mentions an example for his view that the Prophet had performed the *ṣalat* as three *rak'ats* by forgetting,¹¹³ whereas it was actually supposed to be performed as four *rakats*.¹¹⁴ Thus, depending on the verses¹¹⁵ indicating the Prophet is a human being and his own statements reveal that he can also forget like other people, Khaṭṭābī accepts that there are some ḥadīths which should be regarded that they reflect the human side of the Prophet. But the Prophet does not insist on his mistakes.¹¹⁶ Furthermore, there are some narrations showing that the Prophet acted by using his own individual opinion (*ijtihad*),¹¹⁷ because his forgetfulness and mis-*ijtihad*s do not harm his *nubunna/risālat* (prophet hood) and *isma* (infallibility). Hence, the majority of Islāmic scholars have adopted this view.¹¹⁸

Third, Ibn al-Qayyim al-Jawziyya (d. 751/1350) classified the Sunnah to ten parts, he emphasized that five parts of them are in control of the *wahy* and other five types depend on the Prophet's own *ijtihad*.¹¹⁹

Fourth, Shah Waliyullāh Dehlawī (d. 1236/1824) considered the Sunnah in the two groups:

¹¹³ Bukhārī, “Ṣalāt”, 31; Muslim, “Masājid”, 89; Nasāī, “Sahv”, 25; Ibn Māja “Iqāma al-ṣalāt”, 133.

¹¹⁴ Karacabey, “Hadis Vahiy Münasebeti ve Tıpla İlgili Hadisler Hakkında Hattābī'nin Görüşleri”, 219.

¹¹⁵ al-Kahf, 18: 110; al-Isrā 17: 93.

¹¹⁶ Khaṭṭābī, *Ma'ālim al-sunan*, 1: 180.

¹¹⁷ In the eve of Badr Battle, Hubāb Ibn al-Mundhīr al-Jamūh asked the Prophet who has determined the place of troops in Badr, is Allah or the Prophet himself? When the Prophet replied that he determined it depending on his experience. This response is clear evidence for every word and acts of the Prophet are not result of *wahy*. al-Hubāb b. al-Munzir b. al-Jamūh suggested that Muslim troops should dwell close to Badr well. The Prophet adopted his suggest. See. Ibn Hishām, *al-Sīrah*, I: 620.

¹¹⁸ Karacabey, “Hadis Vahiy Münasebeti ve Tıpla İlgili Hadisler Hakkında Hattābī'nin Görüşleri”, 220.

¹¹⁹ Abū 'Abdillah Shamsuddin Muḥammad Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya, *I'lām al-muwaqqi'in* (Beirut: 1991), 2: 99.

i) The part of the Sunnah related to his conveying the *Risalat*/prophethood mission/*tablig* on *ākhirā*/hereafter, jurisdictional *aḥkām*, some issues regarding *malakūt* and metaphysical matters, and the forms of worships; all of these depend on *wahy*.¹²⁰

ii. The part which is not related to the conveying of the *risalat*.¹²¹

According to this classification the ḥadīths having no sort of any relationship with *tablig* are not the product of *ijtihād*. These subjects are mostly based on the individual experiment and experience of the Prophet himself. For example, this section includes some medical ḥadīths (*al-ṭib al-nabawī*) and some actions and practices done by the Prophet as an Arabian custom and the tradition of his region and time. As a result, according to Shah Waliyyullāh Dehlawī, some words of the Messenger of Allah are not related to the conveying of the religion (religious communiqué). Abdulghani Abdulkhāliq embraced the same classification.¹²²

Fifth, Mawdūdī (1903-1979) classified the Sunnah into three parts as well:

1. The first part is what the Prophet said and made to convey Islām, and his words deal with the explanations of the Qur’ān. In this regard, the Qur’ān is regarded *al-wahy al-jālī*, but the Sunnah is *al-wahy al-kebafī*.

2. The second part is the commands of the Prophets which emerged in different times and places as a politic leader of Muslim

¹²⁰ “...And whatsoever the Messenger (Muḥammad pbuh) gives you, take it, and whatsoever he forbids you, abstain (from it)...” (al-Ḥashr 59: 17) In this context, Dehlawī mentions this verse as a proof for his view.

¹²¹ “*I am a human being (basher) like you...*” this statement points out this fact. On the Authority Zaid b. Thābit, when his Companions talk about worldly affairs the Prophet would talk about worldly affairs as well. When they talked about Hereafter he would participate in them. see Abū ‘Abdilazīz Qutbuddīn Shāh Waliyyullāh Aḥmad b. ‘Abdirrahīm b. Wajīhiddīn al-Dehlawī al-Fārūqī, *Ḥujjatullāb al-bāliḡba*, trans. into Turkish Mehmet Erdoğan (Istanbul: 1994), 1: 128-129.

¹²² Ahmet Önkāl, “Vahiy-Sünnet İlişkisi ve Vahy-i Gayr-i Metluv”, *Kur’an ve Sünnet Sempozyumu Bildiriler* (1-2 Kasım 1997), 1999, 45.

community. This sort of the Sunnah includes his words which were mentioned by him as a human being, besides the words come out after the consultation with his Companions and his individual juristic opinions (*ijtihad*s). When an *ijtihad* of the Messenger was wrong, Allah would send down a *wahy* (both *al-wahy al-matluw* and *al-wahy al-ghair al-matluw*) in order to warn him and to correct his mistake.

3. The last part is his words which are not related to the Prophethood. (nubuwwah)

Hence, according to Mawdūdī the words of the Messenger of Allah are right and true, because they are enlightened by the light (*nūr*) of *nubuwwah*.¹²³

Sixth, Contemporary scholar Menna al-Kattān divided ḥadīths into two parts: *tawqīfī*¹²⁴ and *tamfīqī*. The Messenger of Allah conveyed the contents of *tawqīfī ḥadīths* with his own words; as for *tamfīqī* ones, they consist of the *ijtihad*s of the Prophet and his *istinbats*. If the *ijtihad* of the Prophet is correct, the *wahy* confirms it; if his *ijtihad* is incorrect, the *wahy* revises and corrects it. But in final analysis, Menna al-Kattān argued that both are under the control of *wahy*.¹²⁵

Seventh, Ibn Āshūr (d. 1393/1973) classified the Sunnah comprehensively and divided it into twelve categories.

- Legislative/*tashrī*
- The *Fatwā*,
- The Judiciary,
- Administrative; his acts as the president
- To promote good and beautiful,
- Peace,
- Guidance for those who consult with the prophet in these matters,
- Advising,
- Directing to perfectness,
- To reminder and suggest the supreme truths.

¹²³ Mawdūdī, *Taḥbīm al-Qurʾān*, 6: 13- 14. www.quran411.com sūra 53: 3.

¹²⁴ What determined as the result of prophetic inspiration.

¹²⁵ Keleş, “Sünnet Vahiy İlişkisi”, 167-169 (quoted from Menna' al-Kattan, *Mebāhis*, 26-27).

- To threat and rebuke,
- What he did as a human being and for his materialistic needs.¹²⁶

Ibn Āshūr also tries to clarify them by giving some examples for each category mentioned above. According to him, the first three items in the list can be gathered under the name *tashrīh*. Among these twelve matters only this part, that is *tashrīh*, is binding.

Finally, a contemporary Turkish jurist Hayreddin Karaman considers the ḥadīth and the Sunnah in two parts: the Sunnah belonging to the religion, i.e. religious matters, and the Sunnah belonging to the world, i.e. worldly affairs. He also classifies the later as:

- i) Topics related to rational sciences and technology.
- ii) Topics concerning totally the individual's training and managing the Muslim society.

The former is mentioned in ḥadīth as “your worldly affairs”.¹²⁷ This depends on the personal experience of the Prophet and his own thoughts. Accordingly, they are not binding. But the latter is concerned with politics, law, economics, social institutions and education etc. The words and acts of the Prophet regarding this field are usually related with religion. Thus, they are binding; because to a great extent, they are based on *wahy*, though some of its parts are based on prophet's personal *ijtihad*, yet the *wahy* approves them explicitly or affirms them implicitly. However, again there are some affairs in this field as well which are non-binding.¹²⁸

3. The Difference of the Sunnah from Wahy

The difference between the *wahy* of the Sunnah and the Qur'ān falls in five very angles. The first one is the issue of attribution of words and the meanings to Allah and His Messenger. Accordingly, the Qur'ān is *wahy* of Allah, as it was revealed to Prophet by Allah; as for ḥadīths,

¹²⁶ Ibn Āshūr, *İslam Hukuk Felsefesi*, 47-65.

¹²⁷ Muslim, “Faḍāil”, 38.

¹²⁸ Hayrettin Karaman, “Bağlayıcılık Bakımından Resūlullah'ın Davranışları”, *Hicr Peygamber ve Aile Hayatı* (Istanbul: Ensar, 1993), 130.

some parts of them are revealed by Allah, but the wording is the prophet's own experiences of his own choice. Secondly, the Quran has a miraculous nature in its eloquence which cannot be even imitated, whereas no such a claim can be asserted for ḥadīth. Thirdly, ṣalāt is performed only by the recitation of the Qur'ān as word of Allah, but not by the Ḥadīth. Fourth, the Qur'ān is *mutawātir*, meaning that its authenticity rights from the first word to the last one is not questionable, yet not all the hadiths are mutawātir, hence this led us to another difference which is this: The Qur'ān is totally *Qat'i al-subūt* (categorically proved by its very being and transformation), but not all hadiths are like wise. The fifth difference is of that the guarantee of preserverence. As the Qur'ān states itself, it is absolutely preserved by Allah with its all words and letters, but there is no such a protection promise for ḥadīths.

The division of *wahy* into two parts as *al-wahy al-matluw* and *al-wahy al-ghayr al-matluw* can be traced back to the time of Imam al-Shāfi'ī, in different terms though. Nonwithstanding, the very first scholar we find employing the terms, as mentioned above, is Ibn Ḥazm (d. 456/1064). After that, these terms seem to have been received by Ghazzālī (d. 505/1111), Bayḥaqī (d. 458/1066) and Suyūī (d. 911/1505). In addition to classification, Ṣadr al-Sharīa' (d. 747/1346), Imam al-Sarakhsī (d. 483/1090) and Ṭahānawī (d. 1158/1745) divide *wahy* into: *al-wahy al-zāhir* and *al-wahy al-bāṭin*. *Al-wahy al-zāhir* includes The Qur'ān and *kbātir al-melek* -which means that the Gabriel brings the knowledge/*ilm* to the hearth of the prophet without speaking- and *ilham*/inspiration¹²⁹ which comes to the heart of the Prophet they have no doubt on its being revealed form Allah. As far as the *al-wahy al-bāṭin* is concerned, it refers to some information that the Prophet enjoyed by using his own individual opinions and *ijtihāds*, and Allah did not reveal any correction.

¹²⁹ The difference between *ilham* and *kbātir al-melek* can be defined as the former is what takes place in the heart of prophet by Allah without any source of envoy and the prophet is sure of its being from Allah. However the latter is by the mean of an angle.

4. The Results of Classification of Ḥadīths and the Common Mistakes

In terms of interpreting ḥadīth or and using it as evidence, there are some common mistakes by ordinary people based on some false assumptions, some of which are as below:

- Having no absolute knowledge of whether the prophet really said these ḥadīths or not,
- Ignoring the fact that only a few of ḥadīth are *mutawātir* in the ḥadīth sources, and majority of them are called *ahād*, meaning that prophetic tradition (that is *mashhūr*, *azīz* and *gharīb*) gives only probable information / *al-ilm al-zannī*, which involves uncertainty,
- Supposing that all the ḥadīth collections purely means the collection of ṣaḥīḥ ḥadīths without taking into account the purpose of classification of the compilers of ḥadīth books, to suppose that all ḥadīths took place in *al-Kutub al-Sitta* and other classical sources are also absolutely sound,
- To presume that sound ḥadīths could reach us exactly in their original wording as they have come out from the mouth of the Prophet and to ignore the possibility that transmitters conveyed them in meaning and sometimes making small changes while keeping the meaning intact,¹³⁰
- To disregard that ḥadīths have different types such as *ṣaḥīḥ*/authentic, *ḥasan* /good and *ḍaif*/weak and even *mawḍu'*/fabricated. In this context, *al-Sunan al-Arbaa'* includes ḥasan, weak ḥadīths along with ṣaḥīḥ ḥadīths, even *Sunan of Ibn Māja* contains a few *mawḍu'* ḥadīths too,
- To think that every ṣaḥīḥ ḥadīth must be applied directly and absolutely,
- To dismiss the case of abrogating and abrogated ḥadīth (*nāsikh wa mansūkh*),
- To neglect the reality of *shāḥ* and other contradictory ḥadīths,
- Not to differentiate between ḥadīths that have universal messages and those which are culture/region- specific,

¹³⁰ For example: Reporting the meaning, multiple incidents, transmitter's shortening of the Ḥadīth, and the capacity of transmitters etc. See Süleyman Doğanay, *Hadis Rivayetinde Ravi Tasarrufları ve Doğurduğu Problemler* (İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslām Araştırmaları Merkezi ISAM, 2009), 31-100.

- To interpret the ḥadīths which were for *targhib* (encouragement of a good deed) or for *tarhib* (discouragement of a bad deed), literally and regard them as absolute principles,
- Extending the personal practices of the Prophet, which are specific to him, to everybody.
- To generalize a substantial *fatwa* that regards a specific person,
- Not to draw attention to the context and ignore the reason of occurrence *sabab al-wurūd* of a ḥadīth such as the place and time in which it occurred,
- Not to take into account that a ḥadīth cannot be contrary to the fundamental principles of the Qur’ān,
- Not to evaluate a ḥadīth within the context of other ḥadīths through the criteria of textual criticism.

5. Failure in Taking into Account the Human Aspect of the Prophet

In several verses of the Qur’ān, Allah Almighty emphasizes that the Prophet is a human being, but he receives *wahy*.¹³¹ He is not an angel,¹³² he cannot know the unknown (*ghāib*) unless Allah reveals to him.¹³³ He does not have an authority for intercession unless Allah gives him permission. His *ijtihād* can be right or incorrect. But his *ijtihāds* related to religion are approved or revised by Allah.¹³⁴ As a human being, he can be exposed to disease, hunger, thirst, like other people. All of these show that he is a *basbar* (human being) and not an angel.

Needless to say that to receive *wahy* and to be under the control of Allah is certainly an exceptional situation. Therefore, Muslim scholars use a metaphor to describe him: “Muḥammad is a human being unlike other people, just as a ruby is among other stones”, this metaphor clearly indicates his virtue and he is not an ordinary person. What makes the Prophet superior than angels is not his extraordinary physical features, but his being a chosen person (*istifā, mustafā*) by Allah as the last prophet,

¹³¹ al-Kahf 18: 110.

¹³² al-An’ām 6: 50; Hūd 11: 31.

¹³³ al-An’ām 6: 50; Hūd 11: 31.

¹³⁴ al-Mu’minūn 23: 33.

kbātām al-anbiyā (the last messenger)¹³⁵ and *ḥabibullah* (the beloved of Allah), his piety, his intellect and his moral praised by Allah¹³⁶ and presented as a sample for Ummah.¹³⁷

Conclusion

The relationship between the Sunnah and the revelation (*wahy*) is a controversial issue among Muslim scholars that mainly three different opinions are put forward in this regard. Even though they are minority, some Muslim scholars, like Ibn Ḥazm, argue that the Sunnah is the second of the two parts of *wahy*, and therefore whatever the Prophet did, it is a product of his prophet hood; because he is under the guidance of the divine revelation and his judgments and *ijtihāds* were approved or corrected by Allah Almighty. Those who argue that “the ḥadīths are also product of *wahy*” use some verses as an evidence to prove their ideas such as al-Najm 53: 3-4 al-Baqara 3:142-144, al-Anfāl 8: 7, Yūnus 10: 15, al-Aḥzāb 33: 37, al-Aḥqāf 46: 9, al-Fath 48: 27, al-Taḥrīm 66: 3 al-Ḥashr 59: 6; As we studied it in detail in last pages that al-Najm 53: 3-4 is used mostly among these verses; but this claim is very problematic and the majority of the Islāmic scholars stressed that in this verse, the pronoun “*humā*” (it) refers to the Qur’ān, not the Sunnah. Moreover, to say that every word or act of the Prophet and his every step is under the control of the Angel Gabriel definitely implies that the Messenger of Allah is deprived of some human faculties such as reason, free thinking and individual opinion. Thus, to hold such a view point is of course incorrect.¹³⁸ Nevertheless it is a fact that the Prophet received some *wahy* apart from the Qur’ān, because there is a lot of evidence supporting this view both in the Qur’ān and the Sunnah. What is more, the majority of Muslim scholars share this opinion.

On the other hand, the scholars who reject the Sunnah is not the result of *wahy* relied on some verses which emphasized that the Prophet

¹³⁵ al-Aḥzāb 33: 40.

¹³⁶ al-Qalam 68: 4.

¹³⁷ al-Aḥzāb 33: 31.

¹³⁸ Mehmet Görmez, *Hadis İlminin Temel Meseleleri* (Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2014), 42.

is a human being and Allah warned His Messenger for his inappropriate *ijtihad*s. Additionally, the Prophet declared that he can forget and make mistake in worldly affairs as exemplified in the case of the inoculation of date palms.

Besides, the majority of Muslim scholars make a clear differentiation between the Qur'ān and the Sunnah in terms of *wahy*, so much so that the former is certain, and its whole words (*alfāz*) and meanings are absolutely from Allah, and was revealed verbatim to the Prophet directly or via the Angel Gabriel; but the later, i.e. ḥadīths are mostly transmitted us by their meanings. Moreover, some of their parts depend on inspiration (*ilhām*), and the rest of it is a compound of *ijtihad*s and the product of the individual experience of the Prophet. Hence in this sense, in terms of their sources, the Qur'ān and the Sunnah are definitely different.

By the way, who represent the modernist approach, who seem to be influenced by some orientalist research to an, put forward another extreme claim that the Sunnah has historical bounds. According to them, the Prophet took account of the conditions of his time and geography, and paid attention to the culture of his society and aimed at addressing the needs of his society. Therefore, most part of the Sunnah is not binding on us. But, in my opinion, even though some part of the Sunnah might have historical bounds, it is clear that they ignore the sight of its universality.

It seems to me that, in order to solve this problem, (whether the Sunnah is the result of *wahy* or not) we should determine accurately the relation between the Sunnah and *wahy*. When we consider the issue in its entirety, we see that the view of those who argued that the source of the Sunnah is completely *wahy* is a controversial issue; thus it has been disputed among Islāmic scholars. Those who consider the Sunnah as a pure product of *wahy* seem to ignore some Qur'ānic verses¹³⁹ revising the mistakes in his *ijtihad*s of the Prophet and aforementioned ḥadīth declaring “*I am a human being like you, sometimes I forget and make mistakes as well*”.¹⁴⁰ The examples in his life clearly indicate that the Prophet made

¹³⁹ al-Tawba 9:43; al-Anfāl 8: 67.

¹⁴⁰ Muslim, “Faḍāil”, 38.

decisions based on his own judgment in worldly affairs such as the matters of war and fertilizing of the date-palms by conjoining male and female pollens. But the companions who followed his advice to leave the grafting of date-palms saw that the produce of that year turned out to be less than in earlier years. So, by considering the result, it was understood that some of his *ijtihads* concerning worldly affairs did not that much sound apparently. It shows that the Prophet acts in a human capacity. This is natural, because he is a human being and it is not the part of his prophet hood to be an expert on the details of all worldly affairs. But it is true that the *ijtihads* of the Prophet in religious affairs were under the control of *wahy* and were corrected by Allah if they were not appropriate; thus we come to understand that, the selection of the Prophet from two options can be unpreferable before Allah. Therefore, it is impossible to argue that all his sayings and practices depend on *wahy*. But as mentioned in a ḥadīth, Muslims should follow him strictly in his decisions on the matters of faith and religion.¹⁴¹

On the other hand, those who argue that there is no relationship between the Sunnah and *wahy*, hold some unsatisfactory hermeneutics in my assessment, thus they are in need to bring some new reasonable, acceptable and satisfactory interpretations of the verses and some qudsī ḥadīths indicating that the Prophet declared that he received them from His Lord. Obviously, the Messenger of Allah was in communication with Allah¹⁴² and as al-Sarakhsī mentioned¹⁴³ he was under the supervision of *wahy* particularly in religious matters; that's why at least some parts of the Sunnah depend on *wahy*.

In final analysis, Islāmic shari'a consists of two fundamental sources: the Qur'ān and the Sunnah. They are the sources of guidance and laws for all Muslims. Even though it is a controversial issue among Muslim scholars that the Qur'ān and the Sunnah depend on the same source, it is clear that The Qur'ān and Sunnah are interconnected and complement each other. Since, most verses point out that whatever the

¹⁴¹ Ibn Māja, "Ruhūn", 16.

¹⁴² Kırbasoğlu, *İslām Düşüncesinde Sünnet*, p 300-301.

¹⁴³ Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Abī Sahl Shams al-Aimma al-Sarakhsī, *Uşul al-Sarakhsī* (Beirut: Dār al-ma'rifa), no date, 2: 97.

Prophets forbade is in fact forbidden by Allah. Hence, it can be said that the Sunnah adds some rulings to the rules laid down by the Qur'ān; because there is an area that The Qur'ān intentionally left it to the Sunnah. But at this point, the problem is what kind of Sunnah is binding. Therefore, Muslim scholars have not regarded all ḥadīths and the Sunnah in same categories, so much so that they classified them according to their authenticity and purpose, if these classifications and differences are not known well or the human nature of the Prophet is ignored, misinterpretations and mistakes regarding ḥadīths would become inevitable; and it will lead us to some misunderstanding of his Sunnah.

REFERENCES

- ‘Abdulghanī, Abdulkhāliq. *Hujjiyya al-Sunnah*. Riyadh: al-Dār al-ālamīyye li’l-kitābi’l-Islāmī, 1415/1995.
- Abū ‘A’lā Mawdūdī. *Tafhīm al-Qur’ān*. Received: 10 June 2019. <http://www.quran411.com>
- Abū Rayya, Maḥmud. *Adwā’ alā al-Sunna al-Muḥammadiyya aw dijā’ ‘an al-ḥadīth*. Beirut: Muassasa ālami al-maṭbuat, no date.
- ‘Ajjāj, Muḥammad al-Khaṭīb. *al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyya. Makānatubā wa hijzubā wa tadvīnubā wa tanfīdh ba’du al-shububāt*. Damascus: Dār al-fīkr, 1431 /2010.
- Albayrak, Halis. *Kur’an’da İnsan-Gayb İlişkisi*. Istanbul: 1993 (in Turkish).
- ‘Ālūsī, Abū al-Sanā Shahābuddīn Maḥmūd b. ‘Abdullāh. *Rūḥ al-ma’ānī*. Beirut: Dār al-fīkr, 1417/1997.
- Āmirī, Abū al-Ḥasan Muḥammad b. Yūsuf. *Kitāb al-‘ilām bi manāqib al-Islām*. nashr. A. ‘Abdulḥamīd Ghurāb. Cairo 1967.
- Andalusī, Abū Ḥayyān Muḥammad b. Yūsuf b. ‘Alī b. Yūsuf b. Ḥayyān Abū Ḥayyān. *al-Baḥr al-muḥīṭ*. Beirut: Dār al-kutub al-‘ilmiyye, 1422/2001.
- ‘Aynī, Abū Muḥammad Badruddīn Maḥmūd b. Aḥmad b. Mūsā al-Ḥanafī. *‘Umda al-qāri sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*. Idāre al-ṭibāa al-munīriyye. Cairo: no date.
- ‘Azīmābādī, Abū al-Ṭayyib Muḥammad Shams al-Ḥaq b. Amīr ‘Alī Diyānuwī. *‘Avn al-Ma’būd sharḥ Sunan Abī Dāwūd*. edit. ‘Abdurraḥman Muḥammad Uthmān, Muḥammad Abdulmuḥsin Kebtī. Medina: el-Maktaba al-Salafiyya, 1969/1389.
- Baghawī, Abū Muḥammad Muḥyissunna Ḥusain b. Mas‘ūd. *Tafsīr al-Baghavī/Ma’ālim al-tanzīl*. edit. Khālīd ‘Abdurraḥman Ak. Beirut: Dār al-ma’rife, 1407/1987.
- Bayḍawī, Abū Saīd Naṣīruddīn ‘Abdullah b. ‘Umar b. Muḥammad. *Anwār al-tanzīl wa asrār al-ta’wīl*. Beirut: Dār al-fīkr, no date.

- Canan, İbrahim. *Hız. Peygamber'in Sünnetinde Tıp*. Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 1995 (in Turkish).
- Dārimī, Abū Muḥammad ʿAbdullah b. ʿAbdurrahman. *Sunan al-Dārimī*. edit. Ḥusain Salīm Asad al-Rādī. Nashr dār al-mughnī, Saudi ʿArabia 1412/2000.
- Dehlawī, Abū ʿAbdilazīz Qutbuddīn Shah Waliyyullāh Aḥmad b. Abdirrahīm b. Wajīhiddīn al-Dehlawī al-Fārūqī. *Hujjatullah al-bāligha*. trans. into Turkish Mehmet Erdoğan. Istanbul: 1994.
- Doğanay, Süleyman. *Hadis Rivayetinde Ravi Tasarrufları ve Doğurduğu Problemler*. İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Araştırmaları Merkezi (ISAM), 2009 (in Turkish).
- Elmalılı, Muḥammad Hamdi Yazır. *Hak Dini Kur'an Dili*. no place: Eser Neşriyat, 1979 (in Turkish).
- Erul, Bünyamin. "Harput'lu Abdulhamit Hamdi Efendi (1830-1902) ve Hz. Peygamber'in Bilgisine Dair Bir Risalesi". *Fırat Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, issue: 6 (2001): 15-16.
- Erul, "Hz. Peygamber'e Kur'an Dışında Vahiy Geldiğini İfade Eden Rivāyetlerin Tahlil ve Tenkidi". *İslamiyat I*, issue: 1(1998): 55-72 (in Turkish).
- Firūzābādī, Abū al-Ṭāhir Majduddīn Muḥammad b. Ya'qūb b. Muḥammad. *Tanwir al-miqbās min tafsīr Ibn Abbās*. Beirut: Dār al-kutub al-ʿilmiyye, no date.
- Ghazzālī, Abū Ḥamīd Ḥujjat al-Islām Muḥammad b. Muḥammad. *al-Muṣtaṣfā min ʿilm al-usūl*. Dirāsa wa tahqīq Ḥamza b. Zuhair Ḥāfız. Jidda: al-Sharīka al-Madīna al-Munawwara li al-ṭibaa wa al-nashr, no date.
- Genç, Mustafa. *Sunnet Vahiy İlişkisi*. İstanbul: Kitabı Yayınevi, 2009 (in Turkish).
- Görmez, Mehmet. *Hadis İliminin Temel Meseleleri*. Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2014 (in Turkish).
- Graham, William A. *Divine Word and Prophetic Word in the Early Islam*. Paris: Mouton, 1977.

- Hatiboğlu, M. Said. *Hız. Peygamber ve Kur'an Dışı Vahiy*. Otto Yayınları, Ankara 2009 (in Turkish).
- Hatiboğlu, "Kur'an ve Sünnet Işığında Hz. Peygamber'in Gayba Muttali Olması Meselesi", *Kur'an ve Tefsir Araştırmaları: (İslam Düşüncesinde Gayb Problemi-I)*, cilt: V, (2003): 23-31 (in Turkish).
- Hilālī, Muḥammad Taqīuddīn and Muḥammad Muḥsinkhan. *The Noble Qur'an*. Medina, no date (In our paper, we quoted the meaning of verses from this translation).
- Ibn al-ʿArabī, Abū Abdillāh Muḥyuddīn. *Tafsir Qur'an al-Karim*. Beirut: Dār al-yaqāza al-ʿArabiyya, 1968.
- Ibn Āshūr, Muḥammad al-Ṭāhir b. Muḥammad b. Muḥammad al-Tunusī. *Tafsir al-tahrir wa al-tanwir*. no date, no place.
- Ibn Āshūr, *Tefsiri't-tahrir ve İslām Hukuk Felsefesi* (trans. into Turkish: Mehmet Erdoğan, Fikri Akyuz), Istanbul 1988.
- Ibn Hajar, Abū al-Faḍl Shehābuddīn Aḥmad b. ʿAlī b. Muḥammad Ibn Hajar al-ʿAsqalānī. *Fath al-bāri bi-sharh Şaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*. Beirut 1996; Cairo 1978.
- Ibn Ḥazm, Abū Muḥammad b. ʿAlī b. Aḥmad b. Saīd al-Ḍāhirī. *al-Iḥqām fī usūl ahqām*. Beirut 1403/1983.
- Ibn Ḥibbān, *al-Iḥsān fī tartīb Şaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān*. bi tartīb ʿAlī b. Belban. Beirut 1988.
- Ibn Hishām, Abū Muḥammad Jamāluddīn Abdulmalik. *al-Şīrat al-nabawī*. edit. Muḥtafa es-Sekka. Cairo: Muḥtafa el-Bābī al-Ḥalabī, 1375/1955.
- Ibn Kathīr, Abū al-Fidā ʿImāduddīn ʿIsmail b. ʿUmar. *Tafsir al-Qur'an al-azim/Tafsir Ibn Kathir*. Beirut: Dār al-fikr, 1401.
- Ibn Khaldūn, Abū Zaid Walīyyuddīn ʿAbdurrahman b. Muḥammad. *Muqaddima*. trans. into Turkish Zākir Kādīri Ugan. Istanbul: Milli Eđitim Basımevi, 1986.
- Ibn Kutaiba, Abū Muḥammad ʿAbdullah b. Muslim al-Dīnawarī. *Ta'wil mukhtalif al-ḥadīth*. Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islāmī 1419/1999.

- Ibn Qayyim, Abū ‘Abdillāh Shamsaddin Muḥammad al-Jawziyya. *al-Ṭıbb al-nabawī*. nashr. M. Amin Qal‘acī. Egpty: 1402/1982.
- Ibn Qayyim, *Zād al-ma‘ad* (trans. Muzaffer Can), İstanbul: Cantaş Yayınları, 1991 (in Turkish).
- Ibn Qayyim, *I‘lām al-muwaqqi‘in*. Beirut: Dār al-kutub al-‘ilmiyye, 1991.
- Jaşşāş, Abū Bakr Aḥmad b. Alī Rādī. *Abqām al-Qur‘ān*. edit. Muḥammad al-Şādiq al-Kamhawī. Beirut: Dār iḥyā al-turāth al-‘Arabī, 1405.
- Karacabey, Salih. “Hadis Vahiy Münasebeti ve Tıpla İlgili Hadisler Hakkında Hattābī’nin Görüşleri”. *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*. v. 4, issue: 4 (1992): 217-226 (in Turkish).
- Karaman, Hayrettin. “Bağlayıcılık Bakımından Resülullah’ın Davranışları”. *Hz. Peygamber ve Aile Hayatı*. İstanbul: Ensar, 1993 (in Turkish).
- Keleş, Ahmet. “Sunnet Vahiy İlişkisi”. *Dicle Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*. vol. I, (1999): 151-194 (in Turkish).
- Khaṭīb el-Baghdādī, Abū Bakr Aḥmad b. ‘Alī b. Sābit. *Jāmi li akblāq al-rāwī*, edit. Abū ‘Abdillāh al-Surqī, İbrahim Ḥamdī al-Madanī. Medina: al-Maktaba al-‘ilmiyya, 1991.
- Khaṭīb el-Baghdādī, *al-Kifāya fi ma‘rifat usūl al-rivāya*. edit. Abū Ishāq b. İbrahim Muştafa. Beirut: Dār al-hudā, 1423/2003.
- Khaṭṭābī, Abū Sulaimān Ḥamd b. Muḥammad. *Maalimu’s-sunan*. maa Mundzirī’s Mukhtasar. Beirut: Dār al-ma‘rifa, 1980.
- Khaṭṭābī, *I‘lām al-ḥadīth fi sharḥ Şaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*. edit. Muḥammad b. Şa‘d b. ‘Abdurrahman. Mecca: Jāmiā Umm al-Qurā, 1980.
- Kırbaçoğlu, Hayri. *İslam Düşüncesinde Sünnet*. Ankara: Ankara Okulu Yayınları, 1996 (in Turkish).
- Mawdüdī, Abū al-A‘lā, *Sünnetin Anayasal Niteliği*. trans. N. Ahmet Asrar. İstanbul: Bengisu, 1997 (in Turkish).
- Muqātil, Abū al-Ḥasan Muqātil b. Sulaimān b. Bashīr. *Tefsīr Muqātil b. Sulaimān*. edit. Aḥmad Farīd. Beirut: Dār al-kutub al-‘ilmiyye, 1424/2003.

- Nadwī, Sayyid Sulaimān. *Tahqīq ma'na al-Sunnah wa bayān al-hāja ilayhā*. trans. into Arabic 'Abdulwahhāb al-Dahlawī. Cairo: al-Maṭbaa al-Salafiyya, 1399.
- Nasafī, Abū al-Barakāt Ḥafīzuddīn 'Abdullah b. Aḥmad b. Maḥmud. *Madārik al-tanzīl ve haqāiq al-ta'wīl*. rajaahū wa ḍabṭuhū wa ashrafa 'alayh: Ibrahim Muḥammad Ramaḍan. Beirut: Dār al-qalam, 1408/1989.
- Önkāl, Ahmet. "Vahiy-Sünnet İlişkisi ve Vahy-i Gayr-i Metluv". *Kur'an ve Sünnet Sempozyumu Bildiriler* (1999): 55-69.
- Özafşar, Mehmet Emin. "Hadisçilerin Peygamber Tasavvuru/Anlayışı". *Diyanet İlmî Dergi [Diyanet İşleri Reislîği Yıllığı] Peygamberimiz Hz Muḥammad (SAV) özel sayısı*. 2000, 2003, issue: Özel Sayı, 318, 319 (in Turkish).
- Qummī, Abū al-Ḥasan 'Alī b. Ibrāhim. *Tafsīr al-Qummī*. Qum: Dār al-Hujja, 1426.
- Qurtubī, Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Abī Bakr b. Farh. *al-Jāmi' li ahqām al-Qur'an*. edit. 'Abdurrazzāq al-Ḥamdī, Beirut: Dār al-nāshr al-'Arabī, 418/1997.
- Rāḍī, Fakhruddīn. *Mafātih al-ghayb*. Beirut: Dār ihyā turāth al-'Arabī, no date.
- Sa'labī, Abū Ishāq Aḥmad b. Muḥammad b. Ibrāhim Nisābūrī. *al-Kashf wa al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur'an/Tafsīr al-Sa'labī*. Beirut: Dār ihyā al-turāth al-'Arabī, 1422/2002.
- Sarakhsī, Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Abī Sahl Shams al-Aimma. *Uṣūl al-Sarakhsī*. Beirut: Dār al-ma'rifa, no date,
- Shāfi'ī, Abū 'Abdillah Muḥammad b. Idris b. 'Abbas. *al-Umm*. edit. Muḥammad Zuhri en-Najjār. Beirut: no date; edit. 'Alī Muḥammad, Ādil Aḥmad, Aḥmad 'Īsā Ḥasan Ma'sarawī. Beirut: Dār ihyā al-turāth al-'Arabī, 2001/1422.
- Shāfi'ī, *al-Risāla*. edit. Maḥmud Matruhī. Beirut: Dār al-fikr, 1430/2009.
- Shanqitī, Muḥammad Amīn b. Muḥammad Mukhtār. *Adwā al-bayān fī izāh al-Qur'an*. Riyāḍ: al-Matabi'u al-ahliyya, 1983/1403.

- Shāṭibī, Abū Ishāk Ibrāhīm b. Mūsā b. Muḥammad el-Ghīrnātī. *al-Muwāfaqāt*. Cairo: Maṭbaa Muṣṭafa Muḥammad, do date.
- Shawqānī, Abū Abdillāh Muḥammad b. ‘Alī b. Muḥammad al-Ḥawlānī Shawqānī. *Fath al-Qadīr: al-Jāmi’ bayna fanni al-rivāya wa al-dirāya min ‘ilm al-tafsīr*. Beirut: Dār al-fīkr, no date.
- Sibā’ī, Muṣṭafa. *al-Sunnah wa makānatuhā fī al-tasbrī al-Islāmī*. Damascus: el-Maktaba al-Islāmiyya, 1978.
- Ṣubḥī al-Ṣāliḥ. *‘Ulūm al-ḥadīth wa muṣṭalahuh*. Dār al-‘ilm li al-malayin, Beirut 1984.
- Suyūṭī, Abū al-Faḍl Jalāluddīn ‘Abdurrahmān b. Abī Bakr, *Miftāḥ al-janna fī al-ihtijāj bi’s-Sunnah*. edit. al-Sayyid al-Jamīlī. Cairo: Maktaba al-thkāfa al-dīniyya, no date.
- Suyūṭī, *Sünnetin Dindeki Yeri*. trans. into Turkish Enbiya Yıldırım. Istanbul: Rağbet Yayınları, 2000.
- Suyūṭī, *al-Itqān fī ‘ulūm al-Qur’ān*. edit. Muḥammad Abū al-Fada Ibrahim. Hey’et al-Miṣriyya al-‘amma li’l-kitāb, 1394/1974.
- Ṭabarī, Abū Ja‘far Ibn Jarīr Muḥammad b. Jarīr b. Yazīd. *Jāmi’ al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur’ān*. Beirut: Dār al-fīkr, 1405.
- Ṭabarsī, Abū ‘Alī Amīnuddīn Faḍl b. Ḥasan b. Faḍl. *Majma al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur’ān*. Beirut: Muassasa al-‘ilam li’l-maṭbuat, 1215/1995.
- Usmānī, Muḥammad Taqī, *The Authority of Sunnah*. trans. into Turkish Ibrahim Kutluay. Istanbul: Rağbet Yayınları, 2005.
- Zuhaylī. Wahba. *Tafsīr al-munīr fī ‘aqāda wa al-sbarā wa al-manhaj*. Beirut: Dār al-fīkr al-muāṣir; Damascus: Dār al-fīkr 1991/1411.
- <http://sunnah.com/> the translation of ḥadīths has been received from this website.